



CITY OF  
CARLSBAD

ANNUAL REPORT

# City of Carlsbad

JANUARY 2010



*State of* EFFECTIVENESS

January 2010 State of Effectiveness Report

Table of Contents

Introduction . . . . . 2  
Finance . . . . . 4  
Risk Management. . . . . 6  
Communication . . . . . 7  
Volunteer Program . . . . . 9  
Capital Improvement Program . . . . . 11  
Code Enforcement . . . . . 14  
Planning . . . . . 17  
Housing & Redevelopment . . . . . 19  
Building Inspections . . . . . 22  
Fire . . . . . 25  
Police. . . . . 27  
The Cultural Arts Office . . . . . 30  
Library . . . . . 32  
Recreation & Park Planning . . . . . 34  
Parks . . . . . 36  
Trails . . . . . 38  
Potable Water . . . . . 40  
Recycled Water . . . . . 42  
Sewer . . . . . 44  
Solid Waste. . . . . 47  
Storm Water . . . . . 49  
Street Maintenance . . . . . 52  
Traffic Engineering . . . . . 54  
Facilities . . . . . 57  
Fleet . . . . . 59  
Human Resources . . . . . 61  
Information Technology. . . . . 63

The January 2010 State of Effectiveness Report is designed to provide an overview of the City of Carlsbad's overall performance in many different service areas. This report represents the tenth full year that the City of Carlsbad has issued a report on its performance. The report includes data from the Annual Citywide Survey as well as specific measures for the various service areas.

Carlsbad's performance management efforts are designed to reflect the outcome of city services and are focused on three related areas – service delivery, customer satisfaction and cost efficiency. This process of defining and measuring these three areas helps provide a balanced approach in evaluating the overall effectiveness and value of a service area.

Based on the results of the performance measures, staff identified some key findings:

- The City's long-term fiscal health, while positive, continues to be a concern.
- Customer satisfaction ratings continue to be positive with most City services rated as either good or excellent 90% of the time.
- While the operating cost per acre of the City's parks decreased in FY 2008-09, the visual assessments continue to be high at 93%.
- The number of sewer overflows per 100 miles of sewer main has decreased by 72% since FY 2006-07.
- Carlsbad continues to exceed the benchmark with regard to citizens' sense of safety for both the day and night time hours.
- The performance measures are starting to decline for areas, such as streets and the recycled water system, that are no longer expanding at the levels that they were in the past.
- As a result of budget reductions, costs have decreased for a number of areas, including: Parks, Street, Recreation and Trails.
- The gross annual sales tax for the Village has declined by 10%; however, the overall City results are down by 18%.

Lastly, the Performance Measurement Resource Team would like to thank the various departments and staff actively engaged in continuous

improvement and commitment to the pursuit of excellence through the performance measurement process. These service providers are openly committed to the efficient delivery of services to the people who live, work, and play in the City of Carlsbad.



# Finance

## Benchmark and Current Results

Service Delivery	Benchmark	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
Balanced Long Term Fiscal Condition: 10-year financial forecast	Revenues will be equal to or exceed expenditures for each year for 10 years	Yes	Yes	Yes
Monthly Financial Status Report: Timely Distribution	≤15 Average Working Days	11.6 average working days	12 average working days	10.7 average working days
Business License Processing	Decrease in % of pending licenses year to year	1.50%	1.57%	1.41%
	Decrease in % of delinquent renewals Year to year	2.16%	2.16%	2.49%
	Increase in % of on-line processing year to year	7.08%	7.75%	8.20%
Outgoing Payment Processing	Increase in % of successful payments year to year	99.53%	99.70%	99.71%
	Increase in % of electronic payments year to year	49.00%	50.50%	53.00%

- Overall, most of these indicators have continued to be positive for Fiscal Year 2008-09.
- The Finance Department focused on the long-term financial outlook given the state of the global economy, and continued focus on accuracy and more effective use of technology.

## **TRENDS AND OBSERVATIONS**

- While the ten year forecast for FY 2008-09 reflected positive surpluses each year, the revised 10 year forecast for FY 2009-10 is projecting some annual operating deficits due to the economy.
- The forecast for the next ten years reflects an operating deficit/surplus in the General Fund of slightly negative to \$2.8 million per year, which is less than the previous year's forecast due to the slow economy. The City will adjust operating expenditures to match revenues to eliminate any operating deficits.
- The slow economy is also reflected in the measures for business license processing. The percentage of pending licenses has decreased and the number of delinquent renewals has increased.
- As the City reaches build-out, the emphasis shifts from new infrastructure construction to infrastructure maintenance and replacement. The ability to fund infrastructure maintenance and replacement is important to the sustainability of the City. Through fiscal discipline, the City continues its contribution to the Infrastructure Replacement Fund of 6.5% of the General Fund revenues.
- The ten-year financial forecast also considers the Capital Improvement Program and the timing for the operation and maintenance of new facilities that will be opening over the next ten years.
- Through useful tools such as the Financial Status Report and the ten-year financial forecast, the City will be able to continue to respond to changes in the economy and/or other changes which may be out of the City's control.

## **ACTION PLANS**

- Use the City's web site as a service enhancement vehicle for Business Licensing.
- Continue to explore new avenues to identify possible businesses within the City that operate without a Business License.
- Work with City departments to continue to improve the efficiency and effectiveness of operations, as well as fiscal responsibility, financial reporting and processing of financial information.
- Continue to communicate on a timely basis with Council, management and departments on the fiscal condition of the City.



# Risk Management

## Benchmark and Current Results

Service Delivery	Benchmark	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
Claims Administration	90% of claim determinations made within 45 days of receipt	96%	96%	94%

- A key measure of Risk Management is the timeliness of processing claims. This measure reflects the efforts of all departments to coordinate on the collection of information, writing of reports, and on the evaluation of claims. This provides for an efficient and timely response to claimants which serves to reduce and mitigate liability exposure throughout the City.
- Claims Administration consistently reflects a processing time within the time frames established by law.
- Claims are consistently resolved within the statutory timeframe of 45 days.

## **TRENDS AND OBSERVATIONS**

- Loss control is part of the prudent management of fiscal resources. To this end, Risk Management provides a focused managerial direction for the City's self-insured general liability and property damage insurance programs. Risk coordinates with department's citywide, legal counsel, consultants, third party administrators, and insurance companies to manage claims against the City and minimize losses.

## **ACTION PLANS**

- Risk Management works with all departments to continue to improve loss control measures of Department operations and to evaluate and revise insurance requirements in contracts and permits as necessary.



# Communication

## Benchmark and Current Results

Service Delivery	Benchmark	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
Level of Information	90%	82%	80%	79%

Customer Satisfaction	Benchmark	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
Level of Confidence	90%	79%	76%	74%

Cost	Benchmark	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
Cost Per Capita	To Be Determined	\$8.90	\$11.00	\$8.50

- Communications has been a major area of focus for the City over the past several years. The City evaluates its communication efforts based on the level of information residents feel they have, the cost to provide that information, and the level of confidence residents have in local government.
- Cost per capita expenditures increased in 2007-08 due to the public outreach efforts associated with the Proposition D Citizen Committee and the development of the City's new brand and design costs associated with the Web site.
- In 2008-09, the per capita costs reflect a reduction in the communication budget due to the economic recession.

## TRENDS AND OBSERVATIONS

- Results of the City's communication efforts have been consistent for the past several years. FY 2008-09 saw minimal changes in these results as resident ratings continue to be predominately positive.
- The City completed a major Web site redesign and technology upgrade in 2008-09 and launched a 24/7 cable channel on Time Warner. These new and

enhanced communication channels will make information about city issues, news and events even easier to access.

- Since the cable channel and Web site have the ability to be integrated, with information from the Web site fed directly to the channel, the City achieves economies of scale. Information is produced in one format and distributed through multiple channels.
- Although trends continue to show many residents use the City Web site as a top information source, fully one third of the population never visits the site. The City must continue to make information available through more traditional communication methods, in addition to Web-based content, to reach all segments of the public.

## **ACTION PLANS**

- The city will continue to explore new and innovative ways to communicate with residents, businesses and visitors. One area of focus for 2009-10 is social media, with the launch of a YouTube channel and Twitter feed. As these new outlets are further developed, the reach of city communication efforts should continue to expand. Baseline information has been collected to allow for measurement in subsequent years.
- As consumption of traditional media continues to decline, in addition to social media, the City will also explore more direct communication methods, such as newsletters/neighborhood updates on issues of interest to the community.
- The addition of video capabilities on the new City Web site, the City's new Time Warner channel and the YouTube channel provide new opportunities to communicate through video. The City is adapting its video production capabilities to allow for more breaking news and short, Web-based video updates on city issues, news and events.



# Volunteer Program

## Benchmark and Current Results

<b>Service Delivery</b>	<b>Benchmark</b>	<b>FY 2006-07</b>	<b>FY 2007-08</b>	<b>FY 2008-09</b>
Initial Contact to Response Time	< 3 days 95% of the time	99%	100%	100%
Offered Orientations	At least one per month	2.0	2.7	2.5
Orientation to Referral in less than 3 days	90% of the time	96%	90%	89%

<b>Customer Satisfaction</b>	<b>Benchmark</b>	<b>FY 2006-07</b>	<b>FY 2007-08</b>	<b>FY 2008-09</b>
Volunteer Orientation Evaluation	A satisfaction rating of 4 or higher	4.84	4.75	4.23
Volunteer Satisfaction (measured every other year)	90% or higher rate experience as positive	N/A	92%	N/A

<b>Cost</b>	<b>Benchmark</b>	<b>FY 2006-07</b>	<b>FY 2007-08</b>	<b>FY 2008-09</b>
Cost Effectiveness Ratio of Value to Cost	N/A	4:1	5:1	6:1

- Responsiveness to an expression of interest from a potential volunteer is essential to top quality service. The Volunteer program works to ensure a rapid and adequate response to all those wishing to volunteer in the City.
- Once the volunteers are welcomed into the City's volunteer program, the Community Volunteer Coordinator works to ensure a positive participant experience in both the orientation and volunteer specific service areas.
- Expenditures for volunteer operations are compared to the calculated value of hourly volunteer time. This cost calculation allows the City to see the return on investment and cost effectiveness of the volunteer program.

## **TRENDS AND OBSERVATIONS**

- The city currently has 2,360 volunteers of which 255 were new volunteers. This growth can be contributed to two key factors, one the number of people in the workforce looking to attain new skills and keep active as well as the increase in the quality of volunteer opportunities available.
- This increase in volume might have influenced the slight downward trend in volunteer orientation satisfaction and the number of orientations to referrals within a 3 day window.
- The benefit of the volunteers to the city continues to improve. Based on the standard volunteer rate of value in the amount of \$23.65 per hour, the City received a benefit of \$1,849,186 in FY 2008-09.

## **ACTION PLANS**

- While the calculation for volunteer return on investment is derived from the Independent Sector for the State of California, and the annual Present's Economic Report, staff will work towards another benchmark – ideally one that allows for comparison of the City of Carlsbad, to other local and state-wide volunteer programs.
- Due to increasing volunteer interest, staff will investigate options to provide clerical assistance to Volunteer Resources to maintain high levels of service delivery.
- Staff will create a Web-based survey to implement a low-cost way to define volunteer satisfaction.



# Capital Improvement Program

## Benchmark and Current Results

Service Delivery	Benchmark	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
Percentage of projects completed within approved construction budget	90%	95%	100%	96%
Percentage of projects completed within approved construction schedule	90%	90%	87%	96%

Cost	Benchmark	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
Total engineering cost compared to total construction cost as a percentage	$\leq 30\%$ (FY08) $\leq 37\%$ (FY09)	13%	24%	22%
Percentage of projects with total engineering costs less than the results in the California Multi-agency CIP Benchmarking Study	$\geq 75\%$	100%	93%	84%

- The construction budget is defined as the contractor’s bid plus approved contingency at time of contract award by the City Council.
- Twenty-four of twenty-five projects completed in FY 2008-09 were within their approved construction budget.
- Of the 25 projects completed 24 (96%) were within the contract completion date, compared to 87% (13 of 15) in FY 2007-08.
- The total engineering cost is defined as all planning, design and construction management/inspection costs for the project.

- The City's average project delivery cost percentage for FY 2008-09 is 22% of total construction cost. This is below the percentage range of the top four performing cities in the Benchmarking Study, which ranged from 31% to 38%
- The total engineering service cost compared to construction cost, as a percentage, ranged from 31% to 38% for the four best performing cities in the California Multi-Agency Benchmarking Study 2008 Update. In FY 2008-09, Carlsbad had 84% (21 out of 25 CIP projects) with total engineering service costs less than the average of these four best performing cities.
- The California Multi-Agency Benchmarking study indicates the maximum percentage of total engineering service cost compared to construction cost is 41%. For Carlsbad 21, out of 25 projects (84%) had engineering service cost less than 41%. The benchmark requires that at least 75% of Carlsbad's projects will not exceed the maximum of 41%.

## **TRENDS AND OBSERVATIONS**

- One project this fiscal year did not finish within the allowed contract time, however, the benchmark was met for this performance measure this year, compared to last fiscal year when the benchmark was not met.
- Sixth year results continue to show that Engineering Services costs have been within benchmarking objectives, and construction costs are within the approved budget.

## **ACTION PLANS**

- Staff continually compares engineering estimates to bids received to adjust appropriately the project cost estimates and will continue to monitor construction cost trends and actual prices.
- Staff will proactively review the allocated construction time in the contract and determine if there is sufficient time to account for typical construction delays, such as weather and differing site conditions.
- End of project debriefing meetings will continue to be held to assess project performance and determine where improvements can be made on future projects.
- To improve timeliness of construction projects, staff will place increased effort in communicating with contractors the need to be in compliance with the stipulated time frame shown on their approved project schedule. Areas of concern will be noted and communicated to the contractor where they need to respond with increased effort or changes in construction methodologies. This communication will take place in the regular project

meetings (typically weekly) and in writing when schedule slippages appear to be adversely impacting the timely completion of projects.

- Continue to work with contractors to ensure that construction schedules are met.



# Code Enforcement

## Benchmark and Current Results

Service Delivery	Benchmark	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
Calls for the nine most common categories of services	90% within closure standard of compliance	82%	87%	88%

Customer Satisfaction	Benchmark	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
Customer survey responses of "good" or "excellent"	90%	N/A	98%	98%

Cost	FY 2004-05	FY 2005-06	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
Average Cost per Case Closed	\$346	\$332	\$275	\$263	\$268

- The nine most common categories of service are: Engineering/Right-of-Way, Signs, Zoning, Vehicle Abatement, Vehicle Zoning, Building, Garbage & Junk, and Business License.
- Case closure rates increased in seven out of nine categories and decreased in two, Building and Right of Way cases. This translated into one percent increase in the average case closure time for all categories from last year. A more proactive program of business license enforcement has lead to a twenty percent case increase from last fiscal year with a ninety five percent closure rate. Code officers continue to provide individual case management and this has resulted in more effective tracking and resolution of open cases.
- Customer Service Surveys were sent out to over 150 code enforcement customers during this period and the city received 35 responses. Customer comments are tracked and a manager follow up occurred randomly in

approximately 30% of the cases. Customer satisfaction ratings of good/excellent occurred in 98% of the surveys.

- The average cost per case closed increased a nominal three percent. The average cost per case remained relatively unchanged due to offsetting case load reductions and unanticipated staff reductions in the last half of the fiscal year.

## **TRENDS AND OBSERVATIONS**

- Vehicle abatement cases remained consistently low due to continuous and effective code enforcement programs and practices. The number of vehicle abatement cases remained at six cases this year. Vehicle case closures within the standard compliance time frame increased 17% over last year. Case reduction indicates the effectiveness of the vehicle abatement program.
- The non-anonymous complaint system continues to work effectively allowing greater customer feedback and code enforcement officer follow up regarding how a case is being handled. Customers appreciate notification on the ongoing status of their case.
- Recidivism or the same violation at the same address within a three year period decreased slightly from 445 cases to 415, while the total number of case activity decreased 15%.
- An emphasis on code case management continues to be enhanced and requires code officers to manage building code violation cases from the initial complaint through plan check, permitting and final occupancy. This case management approach to enforcement focuses on the ultimate resolution and code compliance and cross platform coordination with counter staff, building inspection staff and other departments within the city.
- Code enforcement cases that involve neighbor to neighbor conflicts are managed through a multi level approach that facilitates a resolution through a process that includes mediation, enforcement and neighborhood awareness.

## **ACTION PLANS**

- Code Enforcement, the City Attorney's Office, Planning staff, Police Department personnel, Community Service Officers and Storm Water staff will continue to meet on a regular basis to discuss current issues and to ensure consistent and efficient enforcement in those cases that crossover department jurisdictional authority. These cases will be tracked as IDEA (Interdepartmental Enforcement Assistance) actions to allow enhanced service to both internal and external customers.

- Code Enforcement staff will continue to meet independently on a monthly basis to review case management and reporting methodologies to insure consistent reporting and data entry of case status, disposition and appropriate case opening and close dates. In addition, code officers will continue to provide a weekly update to the code enforcement manager on difficult or complex cases.
- Ongoing analysis of the specific types of code cases showing increased recidivism will be done in the upcoming fiscal year to focus efforts on education and community outreach on these types of cases.
- Staff will continue evaluating alternatives to traditional code enforcement techniques by involving Homeowner Associations, business owners, homeowners and other community members in conflict resolution and mediation referrals. Code Enforcement Officers will participate in additional customer service training opportunities in other jurisdictions and organizations. More active participation in State and Regional Code Enforcement Organizations is anticipated.



# Planning

## Benchmark and Current Results

<b>Service Delivery</b>	<b>Benchmark</b>	<b>FY 2006-07</b>	<b>FY 2007-08</b>	<b>FY 2008-09</b>
80% of land use project reviews complete in 3 or less cycles.	80%	77%	97%	100%

<b>Customer Satisfaction</b>	<b>Benchmark</b>	<b>FY 2006-07</b>	<b>FY 2007-08</b>	<b>FY 2008-09</b>
Customer survey responses of "good" or "excellent"	90%	87%	88%	93%

- Review cycles entail reviewing minimum application submittal requirements and identifying project design/standards compliance issues up-front.
- FY 2008-09 is the third year of the service delivery measure. The benchmark is based on an Application Completeness Review Survey completed in September 2006 which included 32 cities throughout San Diego County, Orange County, and Riverside County.
- During FY 2008-09 Planning Staff reviewed 129 land use projects; 129 of the projects were deemed complete in three (3) or less cycles, or 100%. Of the 129 land use projects, 45 projects were deemed complete in two (2) cycles.
- FY 2008-09 is the third year of the customer service measure. Highly satisfied customers are an indication that we are providing services in a manner that is desired and/or expected. The measure reflects customer satisfaction among citizens, professionals, developers and other agencies that have direct interaction with the Planning Department through the discretionary review process.

## **TRENDS AND OBSERVATIONS**

- There are a number of reasons why it is important for staff to expedite land use applications:

- There are statutory regulations on the amount of time an agency has to deem a project submittal complete. Once a project is deemed complete, there are regulations on how long an agency has to approve or disapprove an application.
- The development community demands quick and efficient turnaround times. Long review times add significant costs to development projects and make it more difficult for builders to meet current market trends and to build profitably.

## **ACTION PLANS**

- The Planning Department continues to find efficient methods to communicate with the Planning staff and development community to ensure that everyone knows and understands how the various development processes work up front to assist in efficient processing of land use review application submittals.
- The length of time for a project to be deemed complete and difficulties realized vary significantly based on the complexity of the projects. Staff will continue to develop this measure and work with the Planning staff and development community to find ways to meet or exceed the benchmark. Data will be collected during the fiscal year and reviewed monthly to determine the percentage of projects completed within three (3) or less cycles.



# Housing and Redevelopment

THE VILLAGE AREA

## **Benchmark and Current Results**

<b>Service Delivery</b>	<b>Benchmark</b>	<b>FY 2006-07</b>	<b>FY 2007-08</b>	<b>FY 2008-09</b>
Gross Annual Property Tax Value	Increase > 5%	21%	2%	4%
Gross Annual Sales Tax	Increase > 3%	-1%	-4%	-10%
Commercial Vacancy Rates	5% or less	5%	5%	7%
# of Redevelopment Permits Processed	5 or more	39	60	56

<b>Customer Satisfaction</b>	<b>Benchmark</b>	<b>FY 2006-07</b>	<b>FY 2007-08</b>	<b>FY 2008-09</b>
Public Opinion/Customer Satisfaction – good or excellent	90%	88%	88%	88%
Section 8 Program Assessment – Rental Assistance	Standard Performer or Better	Standard Performer	High Performer	High Performer

<b>Cost</b>	<b>Benchmark</b>	<b>FY 2006-07</b>	<b>FY 2007-08</b>	<b>FY 2008-09</b>
Ratio Public Funding to Private Investment	1:10	1:62	1:6	1:49

- The Village Area has experienced a slight increase of 4 percent in Gross Annual Property Tax Values, and a decrease in Gross Annual Sales Tax of -10 percent. The only area displaying growth in Gross Annual Sales Tax was in the category of food products, with an increase of nearly \$20,000 since the last fiscal year. All other categories, when calculating the Gross Annual Sales Tax, have seen decreases that can be directly linked to the down turn in the economy. The decline in spending is not just being felt in the Village; rather households nationwide are reducing their spending by considerable amounts.

- For each \$1 of public expenditures, the goal is to demonstrate that there has been at least \$10 of private investments made. In FY09, for the public to private ratio was 1:49. During this past year, the Redevelopment Agency scaled back expenditures as a result of the State of California "borrowing" \$1,349,220 without the Redevelopment Agency's consent. Commercial redevelopment of properties has slowed down considerably since FY07. In years past, money has been relatively accessible and both entrepreneurs and banks have been willing to take on monetary risks. Within the past few years, lending practices have shifted and financial institutions have raised their standards when lending money, so opportunities for new growth have dwindled and practically diminished.
- Each year, the United States Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD) surveys their agencies for maximum efficiency and effectiveness. The Carlsbad Housing Agency received a rating of 102 percent and a noted as a "High Performer" for its operation of the Section 8 Rental Assistance Program, which exceeds the desired benchmark. The Carlsbad Housing Agency has received this prestigious award for the second consecutive year. The key factor to achieving "High Performer" was that the Housing Agency able to utilize over 95% of the Housing Assistance funding allocated for monthly rental assistance payments. This resulted in a higher point score which elevated the rating from Standard Performer to High Performer. The Agency continues to be very successful in maximizing the rental assistance opportunities for low income residents throughout Carlsbad.

## **TRENDS AND OBSERVATIONS**

- The overall feeling of the Village Area continues to receive positive feedback from residents, finding the Village to be an enjoyable place to spend their time.
- Even with the slow economy, entrepreneurs are capitalizing and continuing to open in the Village, adding to the diversity of businesses and helping to ensure more favorable sales tax figures in the future. Within the past year, restaurants such as Senor Grubby's, the Mediterranean Café, and the Chocolate Bar have all opened their doors. Cultural arts is certainly making a larger presence within the Village, new venues like Ivanffy-Uhler Gallery, Synder Art, and the Artiste Art and Resort Clothing all now have a local address. Looking forward into FY 2009-10, commercial eateries and restaurants such as Vigilucci's Italian Market, Gauyule's Grill and Hodad's are expected to open their doors to customers.
- As of November 2009, the retail vacancy rate is extremely low which possess promising sales tax figures for FY 2009-10.

## **ACTION PLAN(S)**

- Continue to implement programs that focus on revitalization in the Village Area.
- Continue to work in partnership with property owners to implement improvements on their Village properties.
- Collaborate with the Carlsbad Village Association, Chamber of Commerce and other appropriate organizations to implement new programs and/or projects that will continue to enhance the Village Area and ensure the sustainability of its financial health into the future.
- The Housing Agency will continue to evaluate their program against the 14 indicators set forth by HUD. A strong effort will be made to maintain the current top level of performance.



# Building Inspections

## Benchmark and Current Results

<b>Service Delivery</b>	<b>Benchmark</b>	<b>FY 2006-07</b>	<b>FY 2007-08</b>	<b>FY 2008-09</b>
Next Day Inspections	95%	98%	98%	98%
Ave. Inspections per Day per Person	20 to 22	19	18	16
% of Inspections Requiring Corrections	10% to 20%	15%	13%	14%

<b>Customer Satisfaction</b>	<b>Benchmark</b>	<b>FY 2006-07</b>	<b>FY 2007-08</b>	<b>FY 2008-09</b>
Customer survey responses of "good" or "excellent"	90%	N/A	99%	99%

<b>Cost</b>	<b>FY 2004-05</b>	<b>FY 2005-06</b>	<b>FY 2006-07</b>	<b>FY 2007-08</b>	<b>FY 2008-09</b>
Cost per Approved or Partial Approval Inspection	\$44.92	\$51.14	\$78.40	\$82.68	\$89.63

- Inspectors were able to make 98% of all service requests the next working day. Work scheduling and coordination of next day inspections by clerical, inspectors and supervisory staff is a priority and determined in daily department staff meetings.
- The overall number of inspections requiring corrections remained relatively consistent with the previous period and can be attributed to the effectiveness of inspector's conveying code requirements to contractors and homeowners. When an inspector can anticipate potential problems with the progress of a project and communicate this to applicants, costly rework, and missed or failed inspections can be avoided. Inspectors are encouraged to be proactive with assisting both homeowners and superintendents in identifying problem areas early on in construction.
- The current customer satisfaction survey program has been very effective and has received an excellent response from the public with over 70 surveys

returned out of a total number sent out of 218. A data base of all responses is maintained and the building manager performs a follow up call to allow the customer to expand on their experience with department staff, plan reviews, counter contacts and the inspection process.

- The percentage of approved inspections compared to the overall inspection count is consistent with benchmark levels previously established. The 8.9% increase in the cost per approved inspections is a result of the ratio between the reduced number of called inspections and the cost to provide the service.

## **TRENDS AND OBSERVATIONS**

- Overall building code compliance is difficult to observe directly except with proxy indicators. When service delivery and customer satisfaction levels are observed in sum and the ratios are within acceptable industry standards, it's reasonable to conclude that the department is meeting the goal of insuring Carlsbad's built community is safe and customer service is at a premium level.
- While the cost per approved or partial approved inspection increased, the overall department expenditures decreased 3.6% as a result of reduced staffing costs resulting from not filling an existing position and a temporary unpaid employee leave cost savings. The decrease is also attributable to a reduction in the cost of contract plan review services.
- Staffing levels have been reduced by two inspection positions due to the expiration of limited term contracts. Overall, staffing levels are currently adequate to insure professional inspection services for the community.
- With declining housing starts and the slowing of the overall economy, infill projects and an increase in home remodeling versus new construction is expected. This type of construction inspection can be more time consuming and require inspectors to spend additional effort to educate and mentor homeowners. Construction activity is expected to begin a slow recovery in the third quarter of the fiscal year and inspection staffing levels will need to be monitored to ensure resources remain consistent with construction activity.
- A continuing program of cross training within the department will enable a more flexible approach to future staffing allocation. A cross department allocation of inspection resources which include increased storm water NPDES inspection monitoring by building staff will require additional training and administrative staff support.

## **ACTION PLANS**

- Staff will continue to monitor indices monthly and watch for increasing workload combined with lowered detected corrections.
- Evaluate industry benchmarks by contacting other jurisdictions and perform a review of their expenditures and service levels.
- Continue an active and consistent program of sending out customer service portfolios to permit applicants at the time of permit issuance. A self-addressed, postage-paid survey will be included in every portfolio. This will assist in ensuring higher numbers of surveys returned next fiscal year.
- Customer service training of field inspectors will be provided to assure they continue to focus on positive customer contacts at every inspection.



# Fire

## **BENCHMARK AND CURRENT RESULTS**

<b>Service Delivery</b>	<b>Benchmark</b>	<b>FY 2006-07</b>	<b>FY 2007-08</b>	<b>FY 2008-09</b>
All Emergency Responses 1 <sup>st</sup> Unit on Scene in 6 min.	90%	75%	75%	74%
All Emergency Responses 2nd Unit on Scene in 9 min.	90%	83%	84%	84%
Fire Prevention Plan Review within 10 business days	90%	95%	94%	64%

<b>Customer Satisfaction</b>	<b>Benchmark</b>	<b>FY 2006-07</b>	<b>FY 2007-08</b>	<b>FY 2008-09</b>
911 Dispatcher	95%	99%	98%	98%
Response Time to Scene	95%	98%	99%	98%
Competence of Paramedics	95%	99%	96%	98%
Courtesy of Paramedics	95%	99%	99%	99%
Procedures Explained	95%	N/A	N/A	97%
Pain Relieved	N/A	N/A	N/A	98%
Transportation	95%	98%	99%	N/A
Overall Satisfaction	95%	98%	98%	98%

<b>Cost</b>	<b>FY 2004-05</b>	<b>FY 2005-06</b>	<b>FY 2006-07</b>	<b>FY 2007-08</b>	<b>FY 2008-09</b>
Per Capita	\$119	\$122	\$128	\$139	\$142

- In FY 09, the Carlsbad Fire Department conducted and concluded a Standards of Cover Study. Per the Standards of Cover Study findings, the new benchmark for all urgent emergency calls for service, including Fire and EMS calls, are first unit on scene in 6 minutes and second unit on scene in 9 minutes.
- In FY 09, the Carlsbad Fire Department responded to a total of 9084 calls for emergency services, of which 7196 were for Emergency Medical Services.

- The Fire Prevention Division has a responsibility to review new building development and remodel plans for fire code compliance with a processing time of ten (10) working days.
- The cost measure is based upon the Fire Department's net operating cost.

## **TRENDS AND OBSERVATIONS**

- The total number of emergency response incidents in FY 09 was 9084, which represents a slight decrease from 9,503 in FY 08, while the total number of Emergency Medical Service (EMS) responses in FY 09 was 7196, which represents a 15% increase in EMS call volume from 6,317 in FY 08.
- In spite of a 14% increase in call volume over the past 3-years and no additional resources with which to service these requests, Carlsbad achieves a 90% response time for all calls in 7:24 minutes for 1<sup>st</sup> unit on scene and 9:55 minutes for the second unit on scene.
- The Carlsbad Fire Department utilizes two separate surveys to evaluate customer satisfaction. The Public Opinion Survey shows Fire Protection and Prevention Services being rated as somewhat satisfied to very satisfied by over 94% of the respondents, with Emergency Medical and Paramedic Services being rated as somewhat satisfied to very satisfied by over 91% of the respondents. The second survey tool is a Customer Satisfaction Survey, which targets EMS patients transported by the Carlsbad Fire Department. In FY09 the EMS Customer Satisfaction Survey was updated to assess additional aspects of EMS service delivery. That survey showed an overall 98% customer satisfaction.
- The intent of the Boundary Drop is to provide the closest available and appropriate personnel and equipment to the emergency scene. Carlsbad has an average response time of the 1<sup>st</sup> unit arriving on scene in 4:49, while the Regional agencies as a whole averaged 5:07.

## **ACTION PLANS**

- The Carlsbad Fire Department will continue to review the Boundary Drop model. The utilization of the Boundary Drop is being reviewed to create additional efficiencies in regard to training opportunities and overhead support that maximize the availability of resources for emergency response.
- Fire Prevention just accepted Request for Proposals for a voluntary outside plan review process that would return our plan review to within guidelines. This program will be available to persons submitting plans on an actual cost plus handling fee basis.



# Police

## Benchmark and Current Results

Service Delivery	Benchmark	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
Citizens Sense of Safety-Day Citizens Sense of Safety-Night	68% 40%	86% 51%	N/A	86% 52%
Crime Rate – Violent Crime Crime Rate – Property Crime	Lowest third Lowest third	Yes No	Yes Yes	No Yes
Clearances – Violent Crime Clearances – Property Crime	Top third Top third	No Yes	No No	No Yes
Average Response Time Priority 1 Priority 2 Priority 3	6.0 mins. 15.0 mins. 30.0 mins.	6.2 mins. 13.1 mins. 29.0 mins.	5.7 mins. 12.5 mins. 24.8 mins.	6.0 mins. 11.8 mins. 22.6 mins.
Response Time Distribution Priority 1 Priority 2 Priority 3 <i>(January – October data)</i>	90 % < 6 mins. 90 % < 15 mins. 90 % < 30 mins.	58% 74% 74%	62% 76% 77%	58% 78% 78%

Customer Satisfaction	Benchmark	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
Citywide Survey Crime Victim Survey	80% 90%	91% 89%	91% 90%	90% 91%
Sustained Complaints	0	0	0	1

Cost	Benchmark	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
Cost per Capita	\$268 (2009) \$296 (2008)	\$232	\$257	\$255

- Carlsbad continues to exceed the benchmark with regard to citizens' sense of safety for both the day and nighttime hours.
- Carlsbad's mid-year 2009 overall crime rate meets the bottom one-third of cities in the county benchmark and marks the second consecutive year Carlsbad's overall crime rate has declined. Carlsbad's overall crime rate is also lower than the countywide overall crime rate of 26.1. Although below the countywide violent crime rate, Carlsbad's mid-year 2009 violent crime rate just misses the bottom one-third of cities benchmark. The mid-year 2009 property crime rate meets the bottom one-third benchmark and is the lowest Carlsbad has recorded in the last 10 years.
- Generally, a case is considered "cleared" when at least one person is arrested, charged, and turned over to court for prosecution. Carlsbad's overall clearance rate of 24% is a significant improvement from the previous year's clearance rate and is only one percentage point below the highest ranked clearance rate in the county. Carlsbad's overall clearance rate is also better than the countywide total of 17%. Carlsbad's 2008 violent crime clearance rate of 49% is in the middle third of San Diego cities, missing its benchmark for 2008. However, this is an improvement over the previous year's rate of 41% and better than the county average. Carlsbad's property crime clearance rate meets its top one-third benchmark for 2008; double that of the previous year and surpassing the county average of.
- Response time is measured from initial call to first officer on scene. Priority 1 calls are generally violent crimes in progress, some non-violent crimes in progress, armed robbery alarms, injury or no-detail traffic collisions, and burglaries in progress. Priority 2 calls include non-violent crimes in progress such as petty theft and burglary alarms. Priority 3 calls include "cold" reports - a report being taken after the crime has occurred.
- The benchmark for the cost per capita is the average for all comparably sized municipal law enforcement agencies in San Diego County.

## **TRENDS AND OBSERVATIONS**

- Since the cost measurement began in 2001, Carlsbad has maintained a cost per capita for police service at or below the county average and no significant changes are projected.
- Overall citizen satisfaction with the police department continues to be high. Crime victims have been surveyed for over 18 years and continue to report a high level of overall satisfaction.
- With a goal of zero sustained complaints, the department has recorded between zero and two in each year since 2002. The variance in these small numbers is likely to continue in the future.

- Carlsbad residents continue to enjoy a fairly low crime rate compared to the rest of the county; however, as the economy changes, increases in the crime rate are expected. Carlsbad has experienced rapid population growth in the last five years, passing the 100,000 mark in early 2007. In the last 10 years Carlsbad's population has increased by 28%. Maintaining consistently low crime rates during rapid population growth is a challenge Carlsbad has met with success.
- The clearance rates vary significantly from year to year; improvements can be made in the violent crime clearance rate.

## **ACTION PLANS**

- Process improvements will continue in an effort to achieve high clearance rates.
- The crime rate will continue to be monitored on a monthly basis watching particularly for indications of an upward trend.



# The Cultural Arts Office

## Benchmark and Current Results

Service Delivery	Benchmark	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
Projected attendance meets or exceeds actual attendance over 90% of the time	90%	N/A	Yes	Yes

Customer Satisfaction	Benchmark	2007	2008	FY 2008-09
Cannon Art Gallery Visitor Ratings of good or excellent	90%	N/A	90%	92%
Three-Part-Art Education Program Participant Ratings of good or excellent	90%	93%	95%	100%

Cost	FY 2004-05	FY 2005-06	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
Expenditures per Capita	\$8.21	\$9.25	\$9.67	\$9.73	\$9.64
Net Operating Cost per Capita	N/A	N/A	\$8.30	\$8.80	\$9.04

- The Service Delivery measure helps the Cultural Arts Office gauge whether it is successful in reaching intended audiences for its specific programs. The figures are a important quantifiable element used during the yearly budgeting and programming process to help determine whether a program should be continued or not.

## **TRENDS AND OBSERVATIONS**

- Customer satisfaction with the Cannon Art Gallery is gathered through a variety of user surveys. Visitors coming to the Gallery exhibitions and teachers participating in the Three-Part-Art program are highly satisfied at the present time, with a service rating well above the benchmark.
- Both the expenditures per capita and the net operating cost per capita are following their typical growth pattern.

## **ACTION PLANS**

- Audience satisfaction surveys will be conducted at performing arts programs in the Schulman Auditorium similar to those currently being done for the exhibition program at the Cannon Art Gallery.
- Surveys of visitors to the Cannon Art Gallery will be expanded to capture data regarding how first-time visitors learned about the gallery – data which will then be used to help focus future marketing and publicity efforts.
- The Arts Office will continue to offer programs in a cost effective manner, aiming to keep its net operating costs per capita at its current level. One strategy to try to develop ongoing, high quality public programs in a cost-effective manner will be to forge new strategic partnerships with organizations such as New Village Arts, the Museum of Making Music and the Playwrights Project.
- Research will continue in an attempt to find other city-administered arts programs in the state (Walnut Creek, Irvine, Palo Alto) to gather financial data and attendance figures for comparative purposes.



# Library

## Benchmark and Current Results

Service Delivery	Benchmark	FY2007-08	FY2008-09
Ranking among similar-sized California libraries based on 12 categories  Population 100,000 to 150,000	Top Third	3 <sup>rd</sup> Place	3 <sup>rd</sup> Place

Customer Satisfaction	Benchmark	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
% of customers that report being somewhat satisfied or very satisfied with Library services.	90%	97%	97%

Cost	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
Operating Cost Per Capita	\$95.82	\$90.32	\$91.63
Value of Volunteer Hours	16,450 hours \$355,000	17,954 hours \$401,811	16,300 hours \$385,000
Circulation Services Operating Costs Per Transaction	\$.48	\$.52	\$.53

## TRENDS AND OBSERVATIONS

- The Library fares well when compared to other libraries similar in population.
- Citizens continue to rate satisfaction with Library services above the benchmark. The consistency and level of the rating has been over 95% for the past eight years.

- Intercept surveys were not conducted in FY 2008-09.
- The circulation cost numbers through FY 2008-09 do not include the full benefit of Radio Frequency Identification (RFID) technology because acceptance of fine/fee payment at the self-checkout stations had not yet been implemented. FY's 2007-08 and FY 2008-09 includes a partial benefit from the roll out of the RFID system.
- The Value of Volunteer Hours decreased in FY 2008-09 because the literacy program, the Library's program most supported by volunteers, closed for several weeks to move into the new Carlsbad City Library Learning Center location.

### **ACTION PLAN(S)**

- The Service Delivery measure comparison of 12 data points has not led to significant actionable work to improve library services. Therefore, the Library is in search of a measure that better addresses the value of the Library or the difference it makes in the quality of life for the residents of Carlsbad.
- The Library plans to change the focus of a few cost measures and make them more relevant and useful. While we will continue to measure costs and efficiencies for internal evaluation, we will reevaluate the components of the cost measure for future reporting. It is anticipated that this may include moving away from Children and Reference costs. Our action plan is to explore measures that better indicate efficiency and resource optimization. Potential measures may include circulation per FTE, library visitors per FTE, and program attendance per FTE as indicators of efficient service delivery.
- The Library desires to meet anticipated increases in demand for library services with the same or greater levels of efficiency and library user satisfaction.
- The Library intends to implement conducting intercept surveys as quickly as is economically feasible because of the importance of data regarding service demand trends in use.



# Recreation and **Park Planning**

## **Benchmark and Current Results**

<b>Service Delivery</b>	<b>Benchmark</b>	<b>FY 2006-07</b>	<b>FY 2007-08</b>	<b>FY 2008-09</b>
<i>Adult Sports:</i> Participants rating on the level of sportsmanship: Very Good or Excellent	90%	87%	88%	91%
<i>Youth Sports:</i> Participant rating on the level of sportsmanship: Very Good or Excellent	90%	95%	96%	96%
<i>Adult Sports:</i> # of Technical/Ejections/ Suspensions	At or below previous year	6/10/9 (25)	7/4/3 (14)	11/5/6 (22)
<i>Youth Sports:</i> # of Technical/Ejections/ Suspensions	At or below previous year	0/0/0 (0)	2/0/0 (2)	2/0/1 (3)

<b>Customer Satisfaction</b>	<b>Benchmark</b>	<b>FY 2006-07</b>	<b>FY 2007-08</b>	<b>FY 2008-09</b>
Customer Service: City Survey Rating of Very & Somewhat Satisfied	90%	89%	90%	88%

<b>Cost</b>	<b>FY 2004-05</b>	<b>FY 2005-06</b>	<b>FY 2006-07</b>	<b>FY 2007-08</b>	<b>FY 2008-09</b>
Operating Cost Per Capita	\$58.46	\$59.56	\$63.27	\$64.06	\$63.32
Net Operating Cost Per Capita	\$37.64	\$37.83	\$40.04	\$39.30	\$37.07

## **TRENDS AND OBSERVATIONS**

- Sportsmanship in the adult leagues exceeded the benchmark for the first time since its inception in 2001. Although the amount of technical violations could have been lower from year to year the overall message of sportsmanship has led to an increase in repeat participation which includes over 90% of the teams for the second year in a row. Youth Sports has continued to be above the benchmark since 2003.
- The customer satisfaction rating appears to be stable based on the results from the City Survey. The department is beginning to collect data for the new participant survey questions in relation to an updated quality and customer service question with the intent of reporting the results next year.
- The slight decrease in costs this year is based on budget reductions and a more efficient use of resources.

## **ACTION PLANS**

- All Recreation Department service delivery areas will continue to look for opportunities to reinforce the message of sportsmanship. The sportsmanship trainings to the community will continue to increase as long as the local organizations request the additional training.
- The customer service measure will continue to be a focus. Once the participant survey data has been received for a full year, staff will evaluate the results to see if the department's outputs for quantity of diverse programs and quality of services are in line with citizen expectations.
- The Recreation Department will continue to look for alternative funding opportunities which includes grants and fundraising as well as more cost effective programming.



# Parks

## Benchmark and Current Results

Service Delivery	Benchmark	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
Visual Assessment	90%	98%	95%	93%

Customer Satisfaction	Benchmark	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
Citizen Survey Ratings Somewhat Satisfied to Very Satisfied	90%	95%	94%	94%

Cost	FY 2004-05	FY 2005-06	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
Operating Cost per Acre	\$11,591	12,714	\$13,559	\$14,894	\$14,554

- The service delivery measure – as recorded through the Maintenance Assessment Program (MAP) – reflects the ratings of community representatives, outside professionals, and City employees as to the overall quality of care a park is receiving. Areas of focus include irrigation, natural and synthetic turf, tot lots, parking lots, park furnishings, and sports courts. The overall rating of 93% was well above the benchmark of 90%.
- The customer satisfaction benchmark was met with 94% of the customer responses received being Very Satisfied or Somewhat Satisfied.
- The slight decrease in costs this year is based on budget reductions and a more efficient use of resources.

## TRENDS AND OBSERVATIONS

- Carlsbad is continuing to deliver a high level of service, while keeping pace with the increasing population, and the demand of citizens for access to open space.

- The parks system continued to exceed the 90% benchmark in customer satisfaction responses of Very Satisfied or Somewhat Satisfied for the ninth straight year on the public opinion survey.
- As a result of the statewide drought conditions, mandatory water rationing has been imposed. In addition, water rates will likely increase significantly over the next several years. These factors will consequently impact the appearance/condition of the parks landscaping, and the department's operating budget.

## **ACTION PLANS**

- Complete the Parks Maintenance Capital Outlay for remodeling the restrooms at Stagecoach Park, in order to maintain or improve customer satisfaction levels.
- Continue to utilize the Hansen work order and database system for staff allocations, and equipment/materials distribution as needed to accomplish the designated objectives.
- Continue to examine, measure, and adjust accordingly, the ratio of maintenance work between city staff and contractual staff.
- Continue to refine methods in order to perform maintenance and refurbishment work efficiently.
- Continue to work to ensure conservation of funds and resources in austere budget times, including the following: applying for additional grants for qualifying waste compactors/recycling containers; pursuing additional rebates for water conservation retrofits of selective irrigation devices and sport court cleaning equipment; and utilizing energy efficient lighting systems in parks capital outlay/improvement projects, such as tennis court and parking lot retrofits or additions.
- Manage water usage within park sites wisely and effectively, in regard to the ongoing statewide drought conditions.



# Trails

## Benchmark and Current Results

Service Delivery	Benchmark	FY 2006 - 07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
New Mileage per year	≥ 4 miles	4.5 miles	3.8 miles	3.3 Miles

Customer Satisfaction	Benchmark	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
% of customers that report being somewhat or very satisfied with the City Providing Trails & Walking Paths	90%	87%	88%	88%

Cost	FY 2004-05	FY 2005-06	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
Trail Maintenance Cost Per Mile	\$3,276	\$4,076	\$4,729	\$5,133	\$5,101

- Carlsbad is continuing to expand it's trails program to keep up with the ever increasing population and the demand by citizens for access to open space and trails.
- The Coastal Rail Trail is not included in the benchmark results due to the unique nature of this trail.

## **TRENDS AND OBSERVATIONS**

- The mileage added into the trails system is just below the benchmark of opening up trails to the public. In FY 2008-9, the lower trail mileage can be attributed to the impact of the economy and private development. In the past five years, private development has contributed too much of the new trail mileage coming into the system. It is anticipated that if residential and commercial development picks up in the future, that trail development will also increase and contribute more towards meeting the new trail mileage benchmark.

- Trail Maintenance Costs – Costs per mile are still within the benchmark.
- The City’s trail volunteer program continues to grow in both the number of volunteers as well as the number of projects completed by volunteers. It is anticipated that this trend will continue in 2010. The volunteers help to keep the trail maintenance costs within the benchmark.
- Carlsbad residents continue to view open space and trails as an important quality of life issue. Based on the first survey results, additional trails and walking paths are desired.

## **ACTION PLANS**

- Continue to require public trail easements and the construction of trails as part of ongoing private development for trails identified in the Citywide Trails Master Plan that fall within private development areas.
- Continue to process Acceptance Agreements for Irrevocable Offers of Dedication for Citywide public trail easements that were previously rejected as part of private development.
- Continue the planning, development and construction of those trails that have been identified in the Trails Master Plan that will occur on public lands (Example: Lake Calavera). It is anticipated that with approval by the resource agencies of the Lake Calavera Trails Master Plan in 2009, that the City will once again have the opportunity to meet the Service Delivery benchmark of providing four miles of new trail annually. However it should be noted that the trails in the Lake Calavera area will be improved by volunteers and through the funds provided in the CIP budget. The development of trails in the Lake Calavera area can compensate for the downturn in privately built trails that can be expected to continue until residential and commercial development picks up.



# Potable **Water**

## Benchmark and Current Results

<b>Service Delivery</b>	<b>Benchmark</b>	<b>FY 2006-07</b>	<b>FY 2007-08</b>	<b>FY 2008-09</b>
Total leaks and breaks per 100 miles of water pipe in the system.	<32.7	Not reported	30.4	29.1
% of all water samples testing bacteria-free	98%	100%	99.8%	100%

<b>Customer Satisfaction</b>	<b>Benchmark</b>	<b>FY 2006-07</b>	<b>FY 2007-08</b>	<b>FY 2008-09</b>
Citywide Survey	90%	91%	91%	89%

<b>Cost</b>	<b>Benchmark</b>	<b>FY 2006-07</b>	<b>FY 2007-08</b>	<b>FY 2008-09</b>
Cost per acre-foot of water	N/A	\$972	\$1,047	\$1,139
% of unaccounted for water	<6%	3.0%	5.2%	6.3%

- Water service citywide is provided by three separate water agencies; the Carlsbad Municipal Water District (CMWD), the Olivenhain Municipal Water District and the Vallecitos Water District. The CMWD service area covers approximately 85% of the city and generally covers the area north of La Costa Avenue.
- The ratio of leaks/breaks indicator measures the water distribution system integrity.
- The ratio of water line leaks and breaks per 100 miles of pipelines in the system is slightly below the American Water Works Association (AWWA) median average.
- The cost per acre foot of water includes potable water purchases from the San Diego County Water Authority.

## **TRENDS AND OBSERVATIONS**

- Potable (i.e., drinking) bacteriological water quality continued to exceed State health requirements.
- The percentage of unaccounted for water has been increasing over time, this is due in part to a backlog of meter replacements that will be addressed in the automated meter reading program.

## **ACTION PLANS**

- Significant water system failure trends or findings will be reported to the Engineering Division for analysis and recommendation.
- Staff will implement two out of the 15 phases of the AMR program during FY 2009-10. The first installation phase is focused on high use, commercial meters. The AMR meters will help detect water leaks behind the meter and within the distribution system. Detecting and eliminating leaks will help bring the water loss figures down.
- Staff will review the ratio of planned maintenance activities compared to reactive maintenance activities and observe trends. A more comprehensive picture of asset management effectiveness will show a trend with increased activities focused on planned maintenance.



# Recycled Water

## Benchmark and Current Results

Service Delivery	Benchmark	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
Total leaks and breaks per 100 miles of pipe in the system.	32.7	<i>Not reported</i>	0.0	7.8

Cost	Benchmark	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
Cost per acre-foot of water produced	N/A	\$794	\$686	\$733

- The Carlsbad Municipal Water District's Phase II Recycled Water Plant produces recycled water that is used within the service area. In addition, the District continues to buy recycled water via two inter-agency recycled water purchase agreements with the Leucadia Wastewater Authority and Vallecitos Water District.
- The total leaks and breaks per 100 miles of pipe in the system is a measure of the systems integrity. Due to the relative newness of the recycled water system, there were very few leaks or breaks in the system.

## TRENDS AND OBSERVATIONS

- The number of recycled water connections increased from 570 in FY 2007-08 to 614 in FY 2008-09, an increase of 8%. Any new recycled water connections ultimately reduce the City's demand on the potable water system.
- The favorable system integrity rate is due to the relative newness of the system; however, now that the system is aging, resources will need to be allocated to maintenance, inspection and repair activities of the distribution system.

## **ACTION PLANS**

- Significant recycled water system failure trends or findings will be reported to the Engineering Division for analysis and recommendation.
- Staff will review current recycled water purchase contracts to determine opportunities for enhanced cost effectiveness and/or improved efficiencies.
- Staff will continue working on the recycled water purchase agreement with Leucadia Wastewater District due to expire in 2011.



# Sewer

## Benchmark and Current Results

Service Delivery	Benchmark	FY2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
No. of overflows per 100 miles of sewer main	0	4.91	2.46	1.39

Customer Satisfaction	Benchmark	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
Citywide Survey	90%	88%	92%	91%

Cost	Benchmark	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
Cost per million gallons of sewage	\$2,256 (FY08) \$2,224 (FY09)	\$2,150	\$2,187	\$2,461

- Sewer service citywide is provided by three separate agencies; the City of Carlsbad, the Leucadia Wastewater District and the Vallecitos Water District.
- Pursuant to the State-mandated requirements to achieve a goal of zero spills (i.e., "Waste Discharge Requirement for Sanitary Sewer Systems" (WDR)), the benchmark for the number of overflows per 100 miles of sewer main is zero.
- Customer satisfaction exceeded the benchmark and does not show a statistically significant difference compared to the results in prior years.
- The cost benchmark is based on the results of a survey conducted by the American Water Works Association (AWWA) in 2007. The \$2,224 per million gallons benchmark is the median score for all agencies surveyed within the 50,001 to 100,000 customer base category adjusted for inflation.

## **TRENDS AND OBSERVATIONS**

- The number of sewage overflows per 100 miles of sewer main is the lowest it has been in the past 6 years and is below the AWWA 2007 median average of 2.79. However, compared to sanitary sewer system utilities of similar size in San Diego County, Carlsbad ranked in the bottom quartile based on the overflow per 100 miles rate.
- The FY 2008-09 overflow rate per 100 miles experienced another reduction, similar to what the city experienced in FY 2007-08.
- During FY 2008-09, wastewater collections rented a third combination cleaning truck and employed an additional two temporary workers in order to complete the cleaning of the entire gravity sewer system consisting of sewer mains 12" and smaller. This was the first year that all mains of that size were cleaned in a single year.
- Two potential overflows were prevented by the SmartCover™ technology during FY 2008-09.
- The cost increase is largely attributed to the energy expenses at Encina Wastewater Authority.

## **ACTION PLANS**

- Pursuant to the WDR requirement to achieve a goal of zero spills, staff will continue its maintenance schedule for preventive maintenance sewer line inspection and monitoring work to proactively eliminate the number of overflows.
- The Wastewater Division will be coordinating the optimization plan which consists of deploying two "vactor" trucks and a rodding trailer to conduct the cleaning of the sewer system. This shift in resources will allow existing staff to complete the cleaning in a more cost effective manner.
- The CIP projects that were started in FY 2008-09 will be continued in a joint effort with the Engineering staff.
- Staff has initiated a program to conduct point repairs of troublesome sewer lines where roots have intruded through joints. In addition, easement areas which have been prone to a high incidence of roots are being monitored and the manholes being kept free of roots.
- Staff will assess and evaluate the benefits of installing and monitoring the radio-wave based system (SmartCover™) at lift stations.
- As of October 2009, the City of Carlsbad allowed the Encina Wastewater Authority (EWA) to begin receiving SmartCover alarms from the VC trunk

sensor located just upstream of the Buena Vista lift station which is owned by Carlsbad and Vista, but operated by EWA. This will allow EWA staff to be notified in the event of any problems stemming from that lift station. Both Carlsbad and EWA will respond accordingly.

- Complete the optimization plan for the annual cleaning of the sewer system which will allow staff to complete the annual cleaning in a more cost effective manner.
- Staff will meet with EWA and review the methodology for calculating Carlsbad's proportionate share of EWA's annual costs to ensure accuracy.



# Solid Waste

## Benchmark and Current Results

Service Delivery	Benchmark	2007	2008	2009
Annual Disposal Rate	<8.4 lbs.	7.0 lbs	6.5 lbs.	N/A
Annual Diversion Rate	> 50%	58%	61%	N/A

Customer Satisfaction	Benchmark	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
Citywide Survey:				
Trash	90%	89%	n/a	89%
Recycling	90%	80%	n/a	80%
Household Hazardous Waste	90%	71%	n/a	66%

Cost	Benchmark	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
Residential and Commercial Rates	Commercial: Lowest Third	Yes	Yes	Yes
	Residential: Lowest Third	Yes	Yes	Yes

- The Annual Disposal Rate is a new measure based on Senate Bill 1016, the Disposal Measurement System Act of 2008, effective January 1, 2007. This Act requires Carlsbad to not exceed a maximum amount of 8.4 pounds of solid waste per person per day.
- The Annual Disposal Rate benchmark is based on solid waste generation from 2003 through 2006.

- Assembly Bill 939, the California Integrated Waste Management Act of 1989 required jurisdictions to reduce 50% of waste being disposed into landfills by 2000. The 50% diversion requirement remains under the new measurement system.

## **TRENDS AND OBSERVATIONS**

- Customer satisfaction with solid waste services did not experience any significant changes according to the annual public opinion survey.
- Carlsbad's residential and commercial solid waste adjusted rates continue to be the lowest in San Diego County.
- Staff does not anticipate any increases in the level of satisfaction without new or additional services being offered.
- The California Integrated Waste Management Board will be eliminated FY 2011 and staff will be merged with the California Department of Conservation. Staff does not anticipate any impacts.
- Pending legislation, Assembly Bill 479 and Senate Bill 25, if passed will require a statewide diversion goal of 75% by 2020. Assembly Bill 32 will mandate commercial recycling by 2020.
- The economy affects the amount of material in the waste stream. This can cause a downward trend of the disposal rate or an upward trend in the diversion rate, giving a false sense of improvement. If and when the economy improves, the waste stream will increase, thus causing the disposal rate to increase and the diversion rate to decrease.

## **ACTION PLANS**

- Staff will conduct a comprehensive review of the solid waste program and develop a long term strategic plan that addresses not only services, but also disposal options.
- Staff will conduct a comprehensive review of the city solid waste ordinance, if revisions are required, staff will prepare an updated ordinance for Council consideration.
- Staff will continue to monitor legislation as it relates to solid waste disposal and program requirements.
- Staff will continue to promote household hazardous waste programs with the intention of higher participation.



# Storm Water

## Benchmark and Current Results

Service Delivery	Benchmark	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
Notices of Violation received from Regional Water Quality Control Board	0	4	0	0
Temporary beach posting due to urban runoff	0	0	0	0
% re-sampling within one business day of receipt of lab results	100%	N/A	100%	100%
<b>Maintenance</b>				
% High priority inlets cleaned	100%	100%	100%	100%
% Non-high priority inlets inspected	100%	100%	100%	100%
% of poor rated inlets cleaned	100%	100%	100%	100%

Customer Satisfaction	Benchmark	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
% of high priority reports of dumping to storm drain dispatched within 30 minutes	90%	98%	100%	N/A
% of high priority reports of dumping to storm drain with inspector on scene within 45 minutes	90%	N/A	N/A	100%
% of Carlsbad residents reporting that they have seen or heard messages on water pollution prevention	75%	61%	59%	75%

Cost	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
Cost per capita for Engineering - Storm Program	\$3.65	\$3.22
Cost per capita for Storm Water Protection program	\$12.00	\$10.42
Cost per capita for Existing Development - Maintenance	\$7.93	\$9.71
Total cost per capita for Storm Water Protection Citywide	\$23.58	\$23.35

- The City strives to implement programs to reduce pollution in urban runoff including programs to regulate public and private land development during each of the three major phases of urban development, the planning, construction and existing development (or use) phases.

- The City's goal is to have zero Notices of Violation (NOV) related to the National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System (NPDES) Municipal permit, and the results could be considered an indication of overall compliance with the program. This goal was achieved in FY 2008-09.
- The City's goal is to have no temporary beach postings due to urban run-off as monitored in the Coastal Storm Drain Monitoring Program (CSDMP). This goal was achieved in FY 2008-09.
- The NPDES Storm Water Permit requires follow up investigations when CSDMP results exceed state water quality objectives. The City's requirement is to conduct follow-up investigations within one business day of receiving exceedance results from the laboratory. This requirement was met in FY 2008-09.
- The City has met all benchmarks for storm drain (inlets) cleaning and inspection.
- In the past, complaint response measure focused on the response time, which is the time from the creation of the Request For Action (RFA) issue to the time of the first action step, of staff dispatch, to more accurately reflect the response time of Storm Water Protection Staff, this measure was modified for FY 2008-09 to show the time from call receipt to the time an inspector is on-site at the location in question.
- The City's goal is to ensure that 75% or more of the citizenry report that they have seen or heard about ways to prevent water pollution each year. The City accomplished this goal in FY09. This may be a result of increased regional efforts to educate the public about Storm Water Pollution prevention via various media channels, including newspapers, radios and television.
- This is the second year of new cost measures, which consider the City's cost to provide storm water pollution compliance in the planning, construction and existing-development phases. These measures provide a more holistic approach than the prior cost measures, which only looked at existing-development costs.

## **TRENDS AND OBSERVATIONS**

- No beach postings from urban run-off have occurred in the last several years.
- No NOVs related to the NPDES Storm Water Permit have been received in the last 2 years.
- FY 2008-09 is the first year that we have achieved the benchmark of 75% of Carlsbad citizens reported hearing or seeing messages related to storm water pollution prevention.

- In all cases of high priority reports of washing or dumping material to the storm drain, an inspector arrived on scene of the complaint within 45 minutes.

## **ACTION PLANS**

- Develop and or refine measures to reflect outcomes of citywide activities relating to the three major phases of the permit, development planning, construction and existing development (or use).
- Continue to focus on regional and jurisdictional storm water education programs to affect increased awareness of and changes in citizen behavior toward storm water pollution.
- Continue to implement new and revised programs to ensure compliance with the NPDES Municipal Permit and the 2008 Jurisdictional Urban Run-off Management Program (JURMP) document, including training City staff and emphasizing the importance of compliance with the Municipal Storm Water Permit.
- Monitor budgets and expenditures to ensure that the City is receiving the most cost-effective services possible with respect to storm water pollution prevention citywide.
- As the City enters a transition and realignment period, ensure that a smooth transition of program responsibilities and systems for tracking costs related to NPDES compliance are in place.



# Street Maintenance

## Benchmark and Current Results

Service Delivery	Benchmark	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
Street light repairs completed within 10 days	90%	82%	95%	97%
Recall % of city signal lights	Not to exceed 1%	0%	0%	0%
% of Primes and Majors Striped	100%	New	53%	100%
Percentage of time that the desired response times for sidewalk repairs are met	90%	N/A	67%	80%

Customer Satisfaction	Benchmark	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
Citywide Public Opinion Survey: Repair and maintenance of local streets and roads	90%	86%	84%	87%
Citywide Public Opinion Survey: City's management of traffic congestion	90%	64%	68%	70%

Cost	Benchmark	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
Annual maintenance cost per lane-mile	\$6,016 (2008) \$5,976 (2009)	\$6,579	\$6,246	\$5,888

- Street light repairs were completed within 10 days 97% percent of the time in FY 2008-09, a 2% increase over the FY08 results.
- The sidewalk repair response times for urgent hazards that require less than 48 hours for mitigation is somewhat less than the benchmark of 100%, but a significant increase over FY 2007-08's rate of 67%. This is due to the continued focus on mitigation of safety and trip hazards.

- Striping crews were able to achieve 100% striping of Primes and Majors through a reassignment of duties related to graffiti abatement away from the Paint Crew.
- The 90% benchmarks for the customer satisfaction measures are based on residents who rate the measures as “somewhat satisfied” or “very satisfied”.
- Maintenance costs were lower in the last fiscal year, predominantly due to mid-year budget cuts.

## **TRENDS AND OBSERVATIONS**

- The Manual of Uniform Traffic Control Devices (MUTCD), the law governing all traffic control devices, requires that a retro-reflectivity program for signs be in place by 2012. This mandate will require testing of all signs, and replacement of signs that do not meet reflectivity standards. Non-compliance with the MUTCD ultimately can result in the loss of federal-aid funds as well as a significant increase in tort liability. This requirement is certain to increase costs for Street Maintenance in the next few years, as the program is developed and implemented.
- Staff continues to look at funding opportunities, including grants, and alternatives to the General fund to finance Street Maintenance activities. These actions may have a positive impact on overall costs as reflected in the Streets, Signals and Street Lighting budgets.
- During FY 2009-10, the City will begin a project to replace all Street Lights in the City with energy efficient induction lighting fixtures. This will result in significant savings to the Street Lighting Assessment Districts due to reduced energy and maintenance costs.

## **ACTION PLANS**

- Continued implementation of the zone inspection and work plan that is now being used to inspect all concrete and asphalt work and to coordinate repair work with City Overlay program.
- Review supply contracts and work with vendors to improve cost efficiency of purchasing supplies and materials such as paint.
- Review street light repair benchmark to determine if there are any safety concerns that would merit a shorter timeline.
- Implement a proactive zone assessment to identify concrete repairs and coordinate with the overlay program.
- Ensure that all work orders are closed in a timely manner to ensure accurate data gathering capability.



# Traffic Engineering

## Benchmark and Current Results

<b>Service Delivery</b>	<b>Benchmark</b>	<b>FY 2006-07</b>	<b>FY 2007-08</b>	<b>FY 2008-09</b>
% of road segments that meet the Caltrans collision rates per million vehicle miles	100%	94%	90%	86%
Roadway Rideability – Overall Condition Index (OCI)	Average OCI above 80	81	80	78
	100% of Roadways with an OCI above 70	90%	89%	87%

<b>Customer Satisfaction</b>	<b>Benchmark</b>	<b>FY 2006-07</b>	<b>FY 2007-08</b>	<b>FY 2008-09</b>
Average travel time on El Camino Real	June 2000 travel times	0 of 6 measures met the benchmark	3 of 6 measures met the benchmark	2 of 6 measures met the benchmark
Average travel time on Palomar Airport Road	June 2000 travel times	1 of 6 measures met the benchmark	2 of 6 measures met the benchmark	2 of 6 measures met the benchmark

- The Roadway Rideability Overall Condition Index (OCI) is a value between 1 and 100, which is generated by the pavement management software based on the data collected during roadway condition surveys, construction activity, and deterioration curves for various types of pavement. A higher OCI value indicates a better roadway condition.
- The average travel time on El Camino Real measures the average of actual travel times from one point to the other, including delays, in relationship to peak (morning commute/evening commute) and off-peak periods. The peak periods are 7:00 a.m. to 9:00 a.m. (the a.m. peak period), 9:15 a.m. to 11:15 a.m. (the off-peak period), and 3:30 p.m. to 6:00 p.m. (the p.m. peak period).

- The average travel time on Palomar Airport Road measures the average of actual travel times from one point to the other, including delays, in relationship to peak (morning commute/evening commute) and off-peak periods. The peak periods are 6:45 a.m. to 8:15 a.m. (the a.m. peak period), 9:45 a.m. to 11:15 a.m. (the off-peak period), and 4:00 p.m. to 6:00 p.m. (the p.m. peak period).
- The benchmark(s) compare travel times on El Camino Real and Palomar Airport Road to baseline rates that were collected in June 2000. To meet the benchmarks, travel times shall not exceed the baseline rates.
- In FY 2008-09, two (2) of six (6) measures on El Camino Real were below the benchmark. Compared to FY08, three (3) of six (6) measures, or 50%, were below the baseline rates.
- In FY 2008-09, two (2) of six (6) measures on Palomar Airport Road were below the benchmark. This compares to FY08 when two (2) of six (6) measures, or 33%, also were below the baseline rates.

## **TRENDS AND OBSERVATIONS**

- As the construction of new roadways associated with development slows in the future, and absent any refinements to the Pavement Management Program, the OCI will tend to degrade at a faster rate. To counteract this trend, the Action Plan includes the completion of a citywide condition survey and an evaluation of the current pavement management strategy and budgetary needs based on an analysis of the updated condition data. A consultant has been retained to assist in this effort.
- In 2008, 86% of the roadway segments measured for this report were within the statewide collision rate compared to 90% in 2007. In 2008, the number of reported traffic collisions decreased from 867 to 736 collisions compared to the previous year. With the economic downturn in 2008, there has been a noticeable decline in activity associated with residential, commercial and industrial development. Regardless of lower traffic volumes, the number of vehicles traveling into and passing through Carlsbad in 2008 still resulted in conflicts and collisions between vehicles, bicycles and pedestrians.

## **ACTION PLANS**

- With the assistance of a consultant retained by the city, complete a citywide roadway condition survey and load the data into the selected pavement management software. Use this data to complete an analysis of potential pavement management strategies and budgetary needs in the future.
- Completion of current and future construction projects on Palomar Airport Road and El Camino Real will help improve travel times. The widening of El Camino Real from Chestnut Avenue to Tamarack could potentially reduce

travel times along El Camino Real. The addition of a westbound right turn lane on Palomar Airport Road at Paseo Del Norte, under construction currently, should also reduce travel times.

- Staff will develop a traffic signal timing plan that will allow the intersection of El Camino Real and Palomar Airport Road to be coordinated with the other intersections along each corridor. This is expected to reduce travel times on Palomar Airport Road in the a.m. and p.m. peak periods.
- The City recently funded a project to reduce the number of traffic signal false calls by relocating the vehicle detection cameras at several critical intersections on El Camino Real and Palomar Airport Road.
- The City funded a project to update the software used by the video detection system to reduce the number of false calls resulting from glare and fog conditions. These actions should improve travel times on both El Camino Real and Palomar Airport Road during foggy conditions or when glare impacts the video detection cameras.
- Recent adjustments to the traffic signal timing plans on El Camino Real, Palomar Airport Road, Rancho Santa Fe Road, Carlsbad Village Drive, and Cannon Road are expected to help reduce congestion.



# Facilities

## Benchmark and Current Results

<b>Service Delivery</b>	<b>Benchmark</b>	<b>2007</b>	<b>2008</b>	<b>2009</b>
Responses to Visual Assessments	90%	90%	93%	90%

<b>Customer Satisfaction</b>	<b>Benchmark</b>	<b>2007</b>	<b>2008</b>	<b>2009</b>
Customer Survey Responses – rated as “good or excellent”	90%	88%	83%	90%
Work Order Response Time - Emergency	90%	94%	100%	100%
Work Order Response Time – High Priority	90%	94%	97%	98%
Work Order Response Time – Medium Priority	90%	96%	97%	97%
Work Order Response Time – Low Priority	90%	95%	97%	95%

<b>Cost</b>	<b>Benchmark</b>	<b>FY 2007-08</b>	<b>FY 2008-09</b>
Maintenance cost per square foot.	\$8.62 (2008) \$8.57 (2009)	\$5.85	\$6.12

- The Service Delivery measure reflects the ratings of community representatives, outside professionals, and City employees as to the overall quality of care a facility is receiving.
- The Service Delivery results continue to remain high, exceeding the benchmark.
- The Internal survey result from 2009 showed an improvement of 7% from 2008's survey, with 90% positive feedback. An analysis of internal survey comments indicates continued concerns with Heating, Ventilation and Air Conditioning (HVAC) and contracted janitorial services.

- All four sub categories of work order response times exceeded the 90% benchmark. Low priority work orders slipped slightly, which might be expected with increased workload and budget cuts.
- The cost benchmark is based on a national mean as reported by the International Facilities Management Association.
- The calculation of the maintenance cost per square foot includes square footage for all City-maintained facilities.

## **TRENDS AND OBSERVATIONS**

- Overall costs are expected to increase in future years as the cost of raw materials, energy, water, and repair parts continue to rise. In austere economic times, it is projected that fewer new buildings will be brought on-line, which may result in greater use of existing facilities, which will put greater demands on both custodial and maintenance staff.

## **ACTION PLANS**

- Continue to analyze which tasks can best be contracted out and which should remain the function of City staff.
- Seek out energy efficient solutions to building maintenance needs that can heat, light and cool the facilities more efficiently. Use incentive and rebate programs where available to install energy efficient systems.
- Improve Outreach to facilities user groups to ensure effective communication and expectation levels, and ultimately address small problems before they become large, costly repair issues.
- Ensure all new facility sites such as the Joint Safety Training Center, Alga Norte Park etc. have accurate CIP assessments completed to adequately resource the facility maintenance function for these sites once in operation.
- Pursue a formal process to have renovation/remodel requests made by other departments to ensure funding is provided with the request for service.
- Address items noted from raters comments when prudent.
- Attempt to increase marketing of MAP to increase rating panel size in future years, to get a more balanced rating.
- Ensure that an increase in square footage of City owned facilities triggers as increase in staff and outside services budgets.
- Increase use of technology (Laptops) to complete work order information in the field and improve customer service.



# Fleet

## **Benchmark and Current Results**

<b>Service Delivery</b>	<b>Benchmark</b>	<b>FY 2006-07</b>	<b>FY 2007-08</b>	<b>FY 2008-09</b>
Percent of units available for use	95%	97%	98%	98%

<b>Customer Satisfaction</b>	<b>Benchmark</b>	<b>FY 2006-07</b>	<b>FY 2007-08</b>	<b>FY 2008-09</b>
Customer Survey Responses – rated as "good or excellent"	90%	88%	89%	97%

<b>Cost</b>	<b>Benchmark</b>	<b>FY 2006-07</b>	<b>FY 2007-08</b>	<b>FY 2008-09</b>
Costs equal to or lower than Nation estimates for equivalent classes of vehicles	Varies	6 of 9 vehicle classes met the benchmark	6 of 9 vehicle classes met the benchmark	7 of 9 vehicle classes met the benchmark

- The percent of units available for use reflects the quality of the preventive maintenance program as indicated by the availability of City vehicles.
- The 9 vehicle classes which costs are compared to are: sedan, police sedan, light truck, police light truck, medium truck, heavy truck, ambulance, fire apparatus, and police motorcycles.

## **TRENDS AND OBSERVATIONS**

- The City's Fleet Operations Division continued to face some challenges this year with respect to staffing levels, which has impacted everything from costs to customer service levels. This is reflected in the significant decrease in the 24-hour preventative maintenance turn-around measure.
- Fuel prices dipped dramatically in FY08, resulting in significant savings in operating costs. This, plus a move toward right sizing the fleet and improving fuel efficiency has resulted in savings in operating costs for most vehicle classes.

## **ACTION PLANS**

- Attempt to bring Fleet Maintenance Division up to full staffing levels and reduce dependency on part-time staff.
- Evaluate staffing levels vs. Vehicle Equivalencies using national standards to determine whether additional maintenance staff should be requested.
- Review the twenty four hour time period and consider an appropriate time period that meets with the Fleet Maintenance Division's definition of "preventative maintenance".
- Determine if there is a positive linkage between age of fleet and increasing maintenance costs.
- Transition from mileage/age criteria to Life Cycle Costing models for vehicle replacement.
- Continue working with the Fleet Management Committee to downsize vehicles whenever possible, and working with the Fleet customer base to be more collaborative in meeting customer needs.
- Consider purchasing modern equipment and reducing the overall age of Fire Apparatus and Heavy Trucks. Life Cycle Costing models do not support keeping older or high mileage equipment in service.
- Implement new Fleet Maintenance Management Software to better evaluate the true cost of operating the City's fleet.
- Develop communication tools, such as newsletters or paycheck stuffers, to education City staff about the work the Fleet Operations performs.



# Human Resources

## Benchmark and Current Results

Service Delivery	Benchmark	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
Employee Turnover	≤ 6.3%	4.8%	4.4%	2.8%

Cost	Benchmark	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
Time off due to work injury	≤ 5.4 days	5.6 days	5.1 days	5.5 days

- The percentage of full-time employees who left the organization during the reporting period includes resignations and terminations.
- Although not included in the data, in FY 2008-09 the number of retirements was 14, which is the same number of retirements as the previous fiscal year. 14 retirements is the lowest number of retirements since FY 2003-04 when there were 13.

## **TRENDS AND OBSERVATIONS**

- City staff has been actively pursuing workers' compensation claim closure by attending workers' compensation hearings and depositions, delaying claims, utilizing surveillance, and maintaining high visibility on every claim. These efforts, in addition to return to work programs, have helped to minimize lost days of work.
- Excluding the retirement data and comparing the City of Carlsbad's turnover rate to agencies of similar size, Carlsbad's turnover rate is 3.5 percent less than the ICMA average.

- Last year, the Fire Department employees had 16 claims that were responsible for 2% of the City's lost work days (8 days). This year there were 27 workers' compensation claims in the Fire Department. The total number of lost work days due to all of these claims was 60 days (12% of the City's total lost work days). The Fire Department continues to promote an aggressive return to work program to try to decrease their lost work days.
- This year the Police Department accounts for over 51% of the number of lost work days in the City. The department had 33 worker's compensation claims for a total of 251 lost work days.
- For both Police and Fire, the number of lost work days is usually partially attributed to the provisions of Labor Code Section 4850, which entitles Safety personnel who are totally temporarily disabled and not at work, full salary up to one year. This "benefit" often works as a disincentive for employees to return to work. However, an emphasis on encouraging employees to return to work in a light duty capacity has helped counteract this disincentive.

## **ACTION PLANS**

- Human Resources will continue to assist client departments in succession planning and forecasting. Exit interviews are provided for all employees that terminate their employment. The data will be analyzed and made available to the organization.
- City staff is actively pursuing workers' compensation claim closure. The Human Resources Department will continue to work with client departments to implement programs that reduce the number of days an employee is out of the workplace.



# Information Technology

## Benchmark and Current Results

Service Delivery	Benchmark	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
Percent of time users are returned to operational status after placing call to Help Desk	Year over year 10% increase	New measure	New measure	28%
Confidence in Service % reporting satisfied or greater	80%	New measure	New measure	75%

Customer Satisfaction	Benchmark	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
% of employees reporting good or excellent service	90%	Survey conducted bi-annually	81%	93.2%

Cost	Benchmark	FY 2006-07	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09
Mean IT Expenditures as a Percent of Revenue	5.6%	3.47%	3.93%	2.78%

- The percent of time users are returned to operational status after placing a call to the help desk is a new measure for FY 2008-2009. This measure looks at increasing the number of calls of opportunity for the help desk year over year by 10 percent, until the ultimate goal of 80 percent is obtained. A call of opportunity is defined as a call placed by city staff to the help desk wherein the help desk has the knowledge levels, tools and access to return the caller to operational status.
- The information technology customer satisfaction survey was extended in FY 2007-08 to include safety services information technology and the geographic information services departments. After missing the benchmark in FY 2007-08 this benchmark was achieved in FY 2008-09 with 93.2% of the Information Technology customers reporting good or excellent service.
- The customer confidence measure – 75% of customers reported the service delivery by the Information Technology Department as satisfied or greater.

This is below the benchmark of 80% for FY 2008-09. This is a multi-modal measurement combining city staff survey results on four different service delivery/confidence questions. The questions are around staff confidence in: Keeping IT systems up and running, delivering promised services, using technology effectively and providing services that are of value to city staff. The results from all four questions are combined, taking the data from the satisfied and very satisfied categories.

- According to the Info-Tech Research Group's 2007 to 2008 IT Budget & Staffing report, Government entities spend 5.6% of the revenue, or total budget, on IT. Government ranks in the middle of industry sectors in terms of IT spending as a percentage of revenue. The top spending groups within Government are Federal and State governments (8.1% and 8.2% respectively), which have significant infrastructures to maintain, which are interfaced by millions of citizens including social programs, tax collection, records administration, military operations, and other IT-intensive elements of government.

## **TRENDS AND OBSERVATIONS**

- The amount spent on Information Technology operations and capital as a percentage of total revenue is about half of what the fastest growing government entities are spending, with the organizations reporting 7.9% of revenues going to IT investment.
- In FY 2008-2009 the City implemented a new technology infrastructure to improve network speed, reliability and wireless access. Also implemented in FY 2008–2009 was the technology foundation for the city's new Web site.

## **ACTION PLANS**

- Partner the help desk vendor with the network services, applications management and desktop divisions of the Information Technology Department to determine the needed access, tools and security to increase the help desks ability to solve more trouble calls placed by city staffers.
- Provide leadership in long-range planning, implementation, and maintenance of information technology for the City of Carlsbad.
- Further refine operations to produce technical and fiscal efficiencies. Continue to make use of state contracts for cost-effective purchasing opportunities.